

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION REPORT
Certificate of Appropriateness- Downtown Commercial Historic District.
Section 115-320(d)(2)

TO: Heritage Preservation Commission
FROM: Planning Staff
MEETING DATE: September 23, 2021

PROPOSAL: The applicant is proposing construct a new, four-story, mixed-use building on the property located at 421 Jay Street.

PROPERTY OWNER:
Brent Wilkerson
421 Jay Street LLC

APPLICANT:
DBS Group
Kyle Olson

BACKGROUND: The Downtown Commercial Historic District was established by Ordinance in April 2016 along with design standards that are specific to the styles of architecture found within. The local district designation of the Downtown Commercial Historic District was created to encourage preservation of the historic resources of the district, which was named to the National Register of Historic Places in 1994. The design standards and review procedures are used to guide preservation, rehabilitation, new construction, relocation and demolitions. Plans or requests must be approved by the Heritage Preservation Commission prior to any building/demolition permit being issued.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: The applicant is proposing to construct a new, four-story building on the vacant parcel on Jay Street that includes two commercial spaces and 9-12 apartment.

East Façade (Facing toward 5th Ave)

The first floor will be constructed up against the existing, one-story portion of the adjacent building and will not be visible. The 2nd & 3rd floors are CMU block that will be painted to match the color of the brick used on 2nd & 3rd floors of the front facade. The 4th floor is also CMU block painted to match the color of the metal panels used on the 4th story of the front façade.

No windows are located on this façade likely due to building code requirements.



South Façade (Facing Jay Street)

The first floor consists of two storefronts and the entrance into the lobby, stairwell, and elevator to the upper floor apartments. The 2nd & 3rd Floors consists of 5 symmetrical, vertical bays of windows/window openings. Two window openings on each floor are set back within the façade in order to provide for an enclosed outdoor patio. The 4th Floor consists of 10 symmetrical window/window openings. All windows and window openings include a precast pediment and sill. The 1st-3rd floors are clad in brick veneer. The 4th floor is clad in black metal panels. This façade also includes awnings over the three separate entrances. Top of the building consists of a plain, cornice made of EIFS, which is a type of stucco. The south façade is broken up into a bottom, middle, and top section as typical seen in historic commercial buildings. The building also incorporates a progression in sizing of the windows, with the penultimate layer having two windows aligned with a large window below.



West Façade (Facing toward 4th St S)

This façade is also broken up into a bottom, middle, and top section as typical seen in historic commercial buildings. The first floor consists of both brick veneer and CMU block painted to match the brick. The brick veneer begins at the corner with the front facing façade and extends approximately ¼ the length of the façade before it changes to CMU block. The use of materials is the same on the 2nd & 3rd floors. The 4th floor consists of both metal panels and black EIFS. The metal panels begin at the corner with the front facing façade and extends approximately ¼ the length of the façade before it changes to EIFS. The 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors all include two, 2 over 2 windows and one smaller double hung window. There is also a fire escape attached to the exterior of the building extending the length of the 4th floor and a smaller portion of the 3rd and 2nd floors.



North Façade

This façade is also broken up into a bottom, middle, and top section. The first floor consists of CMU block painted to match the brick on the front facade. It also includes a service door leading to each individual ground floor spaces. The 2nd & 3rd floors consist of EIFS painted to match the brick on the front facade. The 4th floor consists of EIFS painted to match the black metal panels on the front façade. The 2nd, 3rd, & 4th floors all consist of four symmetrical, vertical bays of windows each with pediments and sills painted to match the color of the surrounding exterior materials.



SEE ATTACHED PLANS FOR MORE INFORMATION

ANALYSIS:

The following design standards apply:

(f) *Design Review Standards for New Construction*. These guidelines apply to new buildings and additions to existing buildings.

(1) Building placement.

a. Most buildings within the district are built to the edge of the sidewalk, maintaining a continuous wall at the building line. New buildings and additions to existing buildings shall maintain the street wall, except where setbacks are used to emphasize entries or create outdoor seating areas.

The proposed building is built up to the edge of the sidewalk.

b. Buildings shall meet the established building facade line on the block where they are located for at least 75 percent of the length of their front façade.

Standard met

c. The remaining 25 percent of the façade may be set back up to ten feet to emphasize entries or create outdoor seating and gathering areas.

N/A

d. At intersections, buildings shall "hold the corner" - that is, their facades should be located at or near the sidewalk line on both streets.

The proposed building "holds the corner" at the street and alley.

e. Side setbacks shall only be used to create walkways or semi-public spaces such as restaurant patios.

N/A

f. Driveways may only be placed in side yards where no alternative (such as alley access) exists.

N/A

(2) Façade proportions.

a. Buildings shall have a well-defined base, middle and top.

Standard met on all four facades.

b The base, or ground floor, shall appear visually distinct from the upper stories, through the use of a change in building materials, window shape or size, an intermediate cornice line, an awning, arcade or portico, or similar techniques.

Proposed building uses awnings, window shape and size, and an intermediate cornice line to meet this standard on the front façade. Uses a cornice line and change in materials for the west and north façade. N/A for the east façade.

c. The base or ground floor of the building shall include elements that relate to the human scale, including texture, projections, doors and windows, awnings, canopies or ornamentation.

Ground floor façade includes storefront windows and awnings to meet this requirement.

d. Roofs shall be flat or gently sloped, consistent with traditional storefront commercial design.

Roof is flat.

e. Building tops shall be articulated with detailed cornices or parapets.

The top of the front façade and a small section of the west facade includes a fairly simple cornice. The rest of the building top does not include a cornice.

f. The composition of the façade shall be similar to that of surrounding facades. This includes:

1. Proportions of openings.

Standard met.

2. Relation of width to height. Larger buildings shall be broken into a number of smaller bays, to maintain a rhythm similar to the surrounding buildings.

Standard met. (Front Façade)

3. Floor to ceiling ratios.

Standard met.

g. Side walls.

1. Party wall construction is typical within the District. Therefore, relatively few buildings have visible side walls. Where side walls are visible, window openings shall be consistent in their proportions with those on the front facade.

The east façade is prohibited to include windows due to building code. The west façade does not meet this requirement.

(3) Building height.

a. New buildings shall continue the traditional patterns of two or more stories in height.

Building is four stories in height.

b. Maximum height should be based on the pattern established by surrounding buildings on the block face.

Surrounding buildings are a mix of 2, 3, 4, & 7 stories in height.

(4) Building materials.

a. Building materials shall be consistent with the predominant materials in use in the District.

The majority of the building uses masonry materials with a mix of brick veneer, EIFS, and CMU block. A small portion of the building uses metal panels.

- b. Painting of brick buildings is discouraged and shall not be used on new construction. Brick additions may be painted if the existing building is already painted. The paint color of the addition shall match the paint color of the existing building.

No brick is being painted. The EIFS and CMU block are being painted to match the brick and metal panels.

- c. The following materials are appropriate on front or primary façades (those facing the street):

1. Clay brick

N/A

2. Natural stone

N/A

3. Cast stone

The primary façade is primarily brick veneer which is a form of cast stone. Metal panels are used on the 4th floor.

4. Concrete and stucco may be appropriate for some buildings, if approved by the HPC.

Concrete and stucco are not used on the primary facades. It is used on the other facades.

- d. Decorative elements on building facades shall be of materials appropriate to the building style and similar to materials used on existing historic buildings, including metal, wood, stone, polished stone, tile, or glass block.

The only real decorative elements are the pediments and sills around the windows which are appropriate to the building style.

- e. Additional materials may be appropriate on side or rear facades that are less visible from the street, where permitted by the HPC. Materials that may be considered include:

1. Precast concrete units and concrete block, provided that surfaces are molded, serrated or treated with a textured material in order to give the wall surface a three-dimensional character.

CMU block is used on the side and rear facades but are not treated with a texture surface.

2. "Jumbo brick" units shall only be used on the lower third of the building wall.

N/A

3. Split-faced brick or block is not acceptable for downtown buildings.

N/A

4. "Novabrick" may be acceptable in some uses.

N/A

- (5) *Windows and doors.* Most windows within the District have a vertical orientation, with proportions of two or three to one (height to width); some windows are even narrower (four to one proportions).

Standard met.

- a. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors in new construction shall be compatible with that of adjacent buildings. Window and door openings shall comprise at least 30 percent of the area of the ground floor of the primary street façade.

Standard met.

- b. Windows shall be designed with punched and recessed openings, in order to create a strong rhythm of light and shadow in keeping with traditional architecture.

Standard met.

- c. Mirrored glass or glass block shall not be used on street-facing facades. Glass on windows and doors shall be clear or slightly tinted, allowing views into and out of the interior.

Standard met.

- d. Internal window divisions shall be consistent with those of surrounding traditional buildings, or with established styles within the District. Replacement windows consisting of one undivided pane of glass are not appropriate unless approved by the HPC.

N/A

- e. Buildings with modern curtain walls of windows are not appropriate in the District unless approved by the HPC.

N/A

(6) Accessory buildings.

- a. Design of accessory buildings should be simple and unobtrusive. Materials similar to those of the principal building are encouraged, but lower cost materials may also be appropriate as determined by the HPC. Materials that may be considered include textured precast concrete units, "Novabrick".

N/A

(7) Franchise architecture.

- a. Franchise architecture (building design that is trademarked or identified with a particular chain or corporation) is generally discouraged unless it employs a traditional storefront commercial style. Franchises or national chains shall follow the "New Construction" guidelines to create context-sensitive buildings.

N/A

(8) Screening of rooftop equipment.

- a. To the extent feasible, rooftop equipment shall be screened from view from adjacent streets and public rights-of-way.

Location of rooftop not shown on plans.

- b. Rooftop equipment should be screened by the building parapet, or should be located out of view from the ground.

Parapet will be 30 inches in height.

- c. If rooftop equipment cannot be screened or out of view, the equipment shall be grouped within a single enclosure. This structure shall be set back a distance of 1½ times its height from any primary façade fronting a public street. Screens shall be of durable, permanent materials (not including wood) that are compatible with the primary building materials.

(9) Awnings.

- a. When used, awnings shall be installed without damaging the building or visually impairing distinctive architectural features.

Standard met.

b. Canvas or fabric awnings shall be used, rather than wood or metal. Vinyl awnings are prohibited unless approved by the HPC.

Fabric awning is anticipated.

c. Awnings shall be flat rather than curved in profile unless approved by the HPC.

They look flat in the plans.

d. Internally illuminated awnings are prohibited

N/A

FINDING

Overall staff finds the proposed plans to be largely in compliance with the design standards and an excellent effort at designing what would be the first new building in the Downtown Historic District. Staff does have the following comments:

- 1) Cornice at the top of the front façade should extend to the side facades and run the full length to the rear façade.
- 2) The west façade faces a designated pedestrian walkway. Staff would like to the brick veneer and metal panels extend over the entire façade.
- 3) Any exposed CMU block should be textured as required.
- 4) Staff suggests that a smaller storefront type window is placed on the 1st floor of the west façade (alley facing) at the corner. This detail is fairly common with other buildings located on alleys within the district and will help provide that pedestrian connection with the pedestrian walkway.

RECOMMENDED ACTION BY STAFF: This Certificate of Appropriateness is recommended for approval with the following conditions:

- 1) Cornice at the top of the front façade extends to the side facades and run the full length to the rear façade as building code permits.
- 2) Brick veneer and metal panels extend over the entire west façade.
- 3) Any exposed CMU block should be textured as required.
- 4) Smaller storefront window is considered on the 1st floor of the west façade (alley facing) at the corner.